The Nuts and Bolts of Designing and Implementing Training Programs in Developing Countries

Maddalena Honorati and Thomas McArdle
The World Bank
IZA-World Bank-OECD Conference on Activation and Employment Support Policies
May 1, 2012
Objective

• Document key factors of success in program design and implementation
  – Which are the design and implementation features of training programs that work best – generating gains for participants that are large enough to justify their costs?
  – And which are less successful?
• The ultimate goal is to inform new program design and guide practitioners setting up their interventions.
  – A practical, orderly, hands-on guide to the elements of program design and implementation
  – With examples from projects around the world
  – Aimed somewhat more at practitioners
Context and Rationale to training provision

• Training programs are potential solutions to the problem of lack of job-relevant skill (technical, cognitive, non-cognitive)
  – ...the “right” skills for jobs, which are the ones demanded by employers
  – rationale for Government involvement
• Four trends that have greatly influenced the design and implementation of training programs:
  – Demand-led training
  – Lifelong Learning paradigm
  – Competency-based training
  – Emergence of National Qualification Frameworks
Overview

• Scope of training programs and target groups
• What do we know from existing evidence?
• How To Design a Training Program?
  – Identifying target groups
  – Select the type of training and delivery modality
  – Qualification of service providers
  – Assessment of learning
• Implementation Challenges
  – Recruitment and beneficiary selection
  – Selection of providers
  – Implementation arrangements for program sustainability, governance
  – Support services to training programs
Scope of training programs

• **Publicly-supported** programs
  – direct provision (through public training institutes)
  – financial support (funding training costs and subsidizing trainees)
• Targeted to **vulnerable people**
• **Short** in duration (6 months, maximum a year)
• **Voluntary** in nature
• Programs that address lack of:
  1. **Basic skills** (literacy and numeracy)
  2. **Vocational and technical skills**
  3. **Life skills**
  4. **Basic job readiness skills**
  5. **Entrepreneurial skills**
What do we know from existing evidence?

- Second chance programs are more successful when they provide some certification
- Success of vocational and technical training programs is deeply related with the content of the skills provided (demand-driven design) and with on-the-job training
  - Complementing trainings with a personalized counseling and customized job search assistance is also associated with higher program performance.
- Anecdotal evidence from employers surveys around the world suggest that life skills are of increasing importance to how a person is viewed by employers
- Training programs supporting entrepreneurship show different results depending on target population groups (positive on business creation and knowledge, mixed on profits, income of existing entrepreneurs)
- Generally, cost-effectiveness still remains to be tested.
Program Design

• Identifying and Profiling Beneficiaries
• Selecting the type of Training Programs
• Training Delivery Modalities
• Training Plans
• Training Program Duration
• Qualification of service providers and quality assurance of training
• Assessment of Learning
Identifying Beneficiaries

- Disadvantaged youth, including school dropouts and graduates who have difficulty entering the labor market (*Jovenes*)
- The long term unemployed
- Vulnerable women and single parent females (AGI)
- The Poor (including social assistance beneficiaries) (Nicaragua)
- Workers in the informal sector (Sri Lanka)

- Displaced workers (Serbia)
- Mass lay-off workers (Romania)
- Street & working children, orphans, neglected children (Yemen)
- Prisoners & offenders leaving the correctional system (Morocco)
- Conflict Affected People (Sierra Leone)
- Migrant Workers (China)
- People with disabilities (Turkey)
- Minority groups
Identifying Beneficiaries

• Emerges from a social context-a problem
• Eligibility criteria define the target group:
  – Employments status, age, gender, education, income, previous training, geographic location or social group
• Define advocacy, quotas
• Use of Registries: social assistance, UI registry, poverty maps
Profiling Beneficiaries

• Identifying the type of skills constraints

• Identifying special support services:
  – Job preparation and job placement counseling
  – Appropriate orientation in terms of realistic job opportunities and requirements
  – Provision of specialized services: stipend support, access to child care, and transportation assistance, assistance to disability learning
## Training Programs’ Typology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constraints</th>
<th>Type of Training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Insufficient basic cognitive skills</td>
<td>Literacy and numeracy, “second chance” training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of job-specific skills, technical skills mismatch</td>
<td>Technical &amp; Vocational</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of behavioral skills relevant for jobs</td>
<td>Life Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job searching strategies and techniques</td>
<td>Basic job readiness skills, ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insufficient entrepreneurial skills</td>
<td>Entrepreneurial</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Training Delivery Modalities

• On-the-Job only
  – Apprenticeship
  – Work Experience

• Institution-based only

• Comprehensive: Institution based + On the job internship training
Selecting the type of training program

- Address target group skills needs
- Relevance to the local labor market structure (demand led training)
  - What industries and job categories are growing? How much do these jobs pay? Opportunities for entry-level entrepreneurship?
- Type of outcome desired (wage employment, self-employment)
Adjust design to country institutional capacity

• Type of training providers: existing gov. institutions, NGOs and private providers, skilled master crafts persons

• Assessment of public institutional capacity and national training system
  – Does a National Qualification Framework exist?
  – Qualification of Training Providers & QA of Training: pre-qualification vs. rigorous approval
  – Is a national certification system in place? Are assessors available?
  – Is there a market for private training providers?
Implementation of Training Programs

- Marketing a new program
- Recruitment process and beneficiaries selection
- Enrolment, Registration and Orientation
- Selection of training providers
- Conducting a training program
- Curricula & Training Materials
- Support Services to Training Programs

- Implementation Arrangements
- Institutional arrangements, partners, sustainability and scalability
- Governance
- Incentives for stakeholders
- Payment and compensation
- Complaint mechanisms
- Costs and Financing
- Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E)
- What Goes Wrong / Main implementation challenges
Implementation of Training Programs

• Recruitment & Selection:
  – Committees, Random selection, “Creaming” (even of the disadvantaged)
  – Transparency
  – Ensuring Inclusion: quotas, incentives, proportional selection
Implementation of Training Programs

• Selection of training providers
  – Competitive procurement: evaluation criteria, bids, selection process, contracts
Implementation of Training Programs

Support services

• Counseling, Job fairs, orientation
• Job Preparation & Job Placement
• Mentoring
• Services for self-employment, access to start-up capital
Implementation Arrangements

Configuration of implementing actors:

- Implementing agency (government agency, NGO)- Admin., M&E, financial management
- Governance bodies (training councils, Ministries..., NTAs)
- Training providers (Private, public)
- Employers
- Sometimes competing/cooperating/complementary government agencies (Education for Employment-MENA, Grenada) for sustainability & scalability
Governance & Incentives to program stakeholders

**Firms**: Reducing costs of involvement-tools, supplies, TNA & Planning, Mentorship training

**Training Providers**: performance based contracts: milestones, per-individual certified / placed, complementary services

**Beneficiaries**: Daily stipends, (banking, cell phone credits)
Payment Arrangements

Pay Training Providers - pay for performance, milestone payments and per individual

Vouchers - Given to beneficiaries, introduces a new competitive element (Kenya)
M&E

M&E, MIS, Results framework-Example-
Turkey, ISKUR

Established MIS made more user friendly, scaled up to perform better for reporting, comparing courses & regions, performance management
What Goes Wrong in Implementing a Training Program?

- Not sufficiently involving employers, not listening to what employers say, and responding to employers’ needs too slowly
- Too little emphasis on job placement
- Choosing the wrong skill areas (LMI)
- High drop out rate
  - Inadequate stipends
  - Selecting applicants not ready to benefit, or placed in a skill area that does not actually interest them
- Coordination among agencies/partners, wrong arrangements
- Communication issues among stakeholders
What Goes Wrong in Implementing a Training Program?

• Too few or too many applicants
• Difficulties finding the right instructors
• Delays in paying stipends to learners and making payments to providers
• Difficulties recruiting employers and especially the more desirable employers
• Not having the certification procedures and arrangements in place
Getting it Right

• Improve the knowledge and skills of the main implementation actors
• Improve screening of beneficiaries
• Get better training providers involved and submitting proposals
• Identify gaps in the services and fill them
• Improve administration of payments
Getting it Right

• Improve assessors’ performance and increase the number of assessors

• Adjust payment amounts by reviewing and understanding the real unit costs, and differentiating payment amounts according to the kind of training and

• Gradually get more and better employers involved.